

Large Exchange Economies: A Personal Retrospective on Fifty-Five Years of Research

M. Ali Khan*

April 1, 2015

Abstract: The requirement that there be “substantially more agents than commodities” for the viability of Walrasian equilibrium theory in a setting not curtailed by convexity assumptions is both implicit and explicit in the last fifty-five years of work in the subject. In this paper I provide a trajectory of this work by a focus on its technical underpinning afforded by a 1941 theorem of Lyapunov. I identify theorems of Steinitz, Hurwicz-Uzawa, Blackwell-Richter, Shapley-Folkman, Loeb, Armstrong-Prikry, Cassels, Rustichini-Yannelis, Sun, Podczeck and those of Kali Rath and Nobusumi Sagara in collaboration with the author. (91 words)

Keywords: Walrasian equilibrium theory, Lyapunov’s theorem, number of agents, number of commodities

Background material for a talk to be given on April 24, 2015 in honour of the retirement of Professor Donald J. Brown from Yale University.[†] It is jointly authored with Professors Nobusumi Sagara of Hosei University and Takashi Suzuki of Meiji-Gakuin University.

*Department of Economics, The Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, MD. 21218.

[†]The author thanks John Geanakoplos for his invitation.

An Exact Fatou Lemma for Gelfand Integrals: Equivalence of the Saturation and Fatou Properties*

M. Ali Khan

Department of Economics, The Johns Hopkins University
Baltimore, MD 21218, United States
e-mail: akhan@jhu.edu

Nobusumi Sagara[†]

Department of Economics, Hosei University
4342, Aihara, Machida, Tokyo 194-0298, Japan
e-mail: nsagara@hosei.ac.jp

Takashi Suzuki

Department of Economics, Meiji-Gakuin University
1-2-37 Shirogane-dai, Minato-ku, Tokyo 108-8636, Japan
e-mail: takashisuz@jcom.home.ne.jp

Submitted: May 16, 2014

Revised: April 7, 2015

*This paper was presented at the Summer Workshop in Economic Theory (SWET) at the Centre d'Economie de la Sorbonne (CES), Université Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne, in honor of the 65th birthday of Professor Bernard Cornet, on June 26–28, 2014 and at the Annual Meeting of the Mathematical Society of Japan at Meiji University on March 21–24, 2015. The authors acknowledge helpful comments of Erik Balder, Jun Kawabe, Boris Mordukhovich, Konrad Podczeck, and the careful reading of an anonymous referee. This research is supported by a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (No. 26380246) from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology, Japan.

[†]Corresponding author.

procedures are not at issue in the argumentation of the sufficiency result that we offer. Unlike [22], the proof we provide avoids the use of Loeb spaces, or indeed of nonstandard analysis, altogether, and is based on [9], and [16, 18]. And to be sure, it is the necessity of a saturated measure space for the question at hand that is the surprising result if it can be obtained. We also present such a result here.² To frame it more generally, we contribute to the literature a result on the necessity and sufficiency of saturation for the Fatou property, a result developed in [20] for the Bochner integral setting. This result, certainly of interest in its own right, also has a direct application to the equilibrium existence result for saturated economies without convexity assumptions (see [29]).

2 Preliminaries

2.1 Gelfand Integration

Let $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mu)$ be a finite measure space, which is assumed to be complete throughout this paper. Denote by $L^1(\mu)$ the space of integrable functions on Ω and by $L^\infty(\mu)$ the space of essentially bounded functions on Ω . Let X be a Banach space with dual X^* . A function $f : \Omega \rightarrow X^*$ is *weakly* scalarly measurable* if for every $x \in X$ the scalar function $xf : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ defined by $xf(\omega) = \langle x, f(\omega) \rangle$ is measurable. We say that weakly* scalarly measurable functions f and g are *weakly* scalarly equivalent* if $xf(\omega) = xg(\omega)$ for every $x \in X$ a.e. $\omega \in \Omega$ (the exceptional μ -null set depending on x). Let $\text{Borel}(X^*, w^*)$ be the Borel σ -algebra of X^* generated by the weak* topology. If X is a separable Banach space, then X^* is a locally convex Suslin space under the weak* topology (see [37, p. 67]). Hence, under the separability of X , a function $f : \Omega \rightarrow X^*$ is weakly* scalarly measurable if and only if it is Borel measurable with respect to $\text{Borel}(X^*, w^*)$ (see [37, Theorem 1])³.

A weakly* scalarly measurable function f is *Gelfand integrable* over $A \in \mathcal{F}$ if there exists $x_A^* \in X^*$ such that $\langle x, x_A^* \rangle = \int_A xf d\mu$ for every $x \in X$. The element x_A^* is unique (see [10, p. 53]), is called the *Gelfand integral* (or *weak* integral*) of f over A , and is denoted by $\int_A f d\mu$. Denote by $G^1(\mu, X^*)$ (abbreviated to $G^1_{X^*}$) the equivalence classes of Gelfand integrable functions

²Some experts, and this includes the referee, may feel that this result is to be expected in light of results on the compactness and convexity of the Gelfand integral of a multi-function. While taking this point, our observation simply referred to the average reader, unlike the expert, not automatically associating the saturation property with the exact Fatou property for Gelfand integration.

³This does not necessarily mean that f is *strongly measurable*, that is, f is the dual norm limit of a sequence of simple functions, unless X^* is separable regarding the dual norm topology.

- [20] Khan, M. A. and N. Sagara, (2014). “Weak sequential convergence in $L^1(\mu, X)$ and an exact version of Fatou’s lemma”, *J. Math. Anal. Appl.* **412**, 554–563.
- [21] Khan, M. A. and N. Sagara, (2015). “Maharam-types and Lyapunov’s theorem for vector measures on locally convex spaces with control measures”, forthcoming in *J. Convex Anal.* **22**.
- [22] Loeb, P. A. and Y. N. Sun, (2007). “A general Fatou lemma”, *Adv. Math.* **213**, 741–762.
- [23] Loeb, P. A. and Y. N. Sun, (2009). “Purification and saturation”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **137**, 2719–2724.
- [24] Maharam, D., (1942). “On homogeneous measure algebras”, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **28**, 108–111.
- [25] Ostroy, J.M. and W. Zame, (1994). “Nonatomic economies and the boundaries of perfect competition”, *Econometrica* **62**, 593–633.
- [26] Podczeck, K., (1997). “Markets with infinitely many commodities and a continuum of agents with non-convex preferences”, *Econom. Theory* **9**, 385–426.
- [27] Podczeck, K., (2008). “On the convexity and compactness of the integral of a Banach space valued correspondence”, *J. Math. Econom.* **44**, 836–852.
- [28] Rustichini, A., (1989). “A counterexample and an exact version of Fatou’s lemma in infinite dimensional spaces”, *Arch. Math.* **52**, 357–362.
- [29] Sagara, N. and T. Suzuki, (2014). “Exchange economies with infinitely many commodities and nonconvex preferences”, Dept. Econ., Meiji-Gakuin Univ., mimeo.
- [30] Schmeidler, D., (1970). “Fatou’s lemma in several dimensions”, *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.* **24**, 300–306.
- [31] Schmeidler, D., (1973). “Equilibrium points of nonatomic games”, *J. Statist. Physics* **7**, 295–300.
- [32] Sun, Y.N., (1997). “Integration of correspondences on Loeb spaces”, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* **349**, 129–153.
- [33] Sun, Y.N. and N.C. Yannellis, (2008). “Saturation and the integration of Banach valued correspondences”, *J. Math. Econom.* **44**, 861–865.
- [34] Suzuki, T., (2013). “Competitive equilibria of a large economy on the commodity space ℓ^∞ ”, *Adv. Math. Econ.* **17**, 1–19.

An Exchange Economy with Differentiated Commodities and a Saturated Measure Space of Consumers¹

M. Ali Khan²

Department of Economics, The Johns Hopkins University
Baltimore, MD 21218, United States
e-mail: akhan@jhu.edu

Nobusumi Sagara

Department of Economics, Hosei University
4342, Aihara, Machida, Tokyo 194-0298, Japan
e-mail: nsagara@hosei.ac.jp

Takashi Suzuki

Department of Economics, Meiji-Gakuin University
1-2-37 Shirogane-dai, Minato-ku, Tokyo 108-8636, Japan
e-mail: takashisuz@jcom.home.ne.jp

April 23, 2015

¹This research is supported by a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (No. 26380246, Sagara) and by a Grant-in-Aid for Scientific Research (No. 15k03362, Suzuki) from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology, Japan.

²Corresponding author.

$support(\nu_X) \subset Z$ for an weak* compact metric (hence a complete and separable metric) set $Z \subset X$, hence μ has the representations. Let $(\pi, \xi(a))$ be a representation of μ . Keisler and Sun [15] proved

Fact 2. Suppose that a finite measure space $(A, \mathcal{A}, \lambda)$ is saturated, Z and Y are complete separable metric spaces. Then for every measure $\nu \in \mathcal{M}(Z \times Y)$ and measurable function $\mathcal{E} : A \rightarrow Y$ with $\mathcal{E}_*\lambda = \nu_Y$, there exists a measurable function $\xi : A \rightarrow Z$ which satisfies $(\xi, \mathcal{E})_*\lambda = \nu$.

Since $\mathcal{E}_*\lambda = \mu = \nu_{\mathcal{P} \times \Omega}$, we have from Fact 2 a measurable map ξ with $\nu = (\xi, \mathcal{E})_*\lambda$. Then ξ is an equilibrium allocation by Lemma 3.1. \square

3.2 Proof of Theorem 2.2

The proof that a competitive equilibrium allocation is also a core allocation is standard. We skip it. Suppose that $\xi : A \rightarrow X$ be a core allocation.

Let $\bar{\omega} \equiv \int_A \omega(a)d\lambda$, and consider the measure space $(K, \mathcal{B}(K), \bar{\omega})$. Let $L^1(\bar{\omega})$ be the space of Gelfand integrable functions on $(K, \mathcal{B}(K), \bar{\omega})$. Then we can identify $L^1(\bar{\omega})$ as the subspace of $ca(K)$ of Borel measures which are absolutely continuous with respect to $\bar{\omega}$ via the Radon-Nikodym theorem as follows. Let $\phi \in ca(K)$ be a Borel measure which is absolutely continuous with respect to $\bar{\omega}$. Then for each Borel set $B \in \mathcal{B}(K)$, we have $\phi(B) = \int_B \psi(t)d\bar{\omega}$, where $\psi(t)$ is the Radon-Nikodym derivative of the measure $\phi(B)$. We denote this as $\phi = \psi\bar{\omega}$, $\psi \in L^1(\bar{\omega})$ and identify ϕ and ψ . Note that $\|\phi\| = \|\psi\|$.

Let \mathcal{Z} be the space of pairs (C, ζ) such that C is a non-null measurable subset of A and $\zeta : C \rightarrow L^1(\bar{\omega})$ is a Bochner integrable function with $\xi(a) \prec_a \zeta(a)\bar{\omega}$ a.e on C . Let \mathcal{Q} be the (net) preferred set:

$$\mathcal{Q} = \left\{ \int_C \zeta(a)\bar{\omega}d\lambda - \int_C \omega(a)d\lambda \mid (C, \zeta) \in \mathcal{Z} \right\}.$$

Since $(A, \mathcal{A}, \lambda)$ is saturated, we can show that \mathcal{Q} is a convex subset of $ca(K)$ by the same argument of Hildenbrand ([10], Proposition 5, p.62) using a Lyapunov theorem of Khan-Sagara ([17], Theorem 4.1). Note that $L^1(\bar{\omega})$ is separable, since the σ -algebra $\mathcal{B}(K)$ is countably generated because of the space K being a compact metric space⁵.

Let \mathcal{C} be the cone generated by \mathcal{Q} . We will find a linear functional $\pi \in L^1(\bar{\omega})^* = L^\infty(\bar{\omega})$ which supports the cone $\mathcal{C} \cap L^1(\bar{\omega})$; an appropriate representative of the equivalence class of π will provide the equilibrium price vector.

⁵Indeed, this means that $(K, \mathcal{B}(K), \bar{\omega})$ is not saturated; a measure space $(A, \mathcal{A}, \lambda)$ is saturated if and only if for every $E \in \mathcal{A}$ with $\lambda(E) > 0$, the space $L^1_E(\lambda)$ of the integrable functions on E is non-separable. See Khan-Sagara ([18], Definition 3.4).

Fact 3. Let ξ be a feasible allocation and $\bar{\pi}$ a bounded Borel function on K . Then the following statements are equivalent:

- (i) there is a bounded Borel function π^* such that $\pi^* = \bar{\pi}$ a.e and (π^*, ξ) satisfies the conditions (E-1) and (E-2) of Definition 3;
- (ii) For almost all $a \in A$, if $\alpha \in L^1(\bar{\omega})$ satisfies that $\xi(a) \prec_a \alpha$, then $\bar{\pi}\omega(a) < \bar{\pi}\alpha$.

Then on account of Fact 3, it will suffice to show that there does not exist a measure $\alpha \in L^1(\bar{\omega})$ such that $\xi(a) \prec_a \alpha$ and $\bar{\pi}\alpha \leq \bar{\pi}\omega(a)$ a.e. Suppose on the contrary, there existed such a vector α . The separability of $L^1(\bar{\omega})$ and the continuity of preferences would make possible for us to find a set $C \subset A$ of positive measure and a measure $\beta \in L^1(\bar{\omega})$ such that $\xi(a) \prec_a \beta$ and $\bar{\pi}\beta < \bar{\pi}\omega(a)$ for almost all $a \in C$. Define a map $\bar{\zeta} : C \rightarrow L^1(\bar{\omega})$ by $\bar{\zeta}(a) = \beta$ for all $a \in C$. Then the pair $(C, \bar{\zeta}) \in \mathcal{Z}$, hence $\lambda(C)\beta - \int_C \omega(a)d\lambda \in \mathcal{Q}$. Consequently we have $0 \leq \bar{\pi}(\lambda(C)\beta - \int_C \omega(a)d\lambda) = \int_C \bar{\pi}(\beta - \omega(a))d\lambda$, which contradicts that $\bar{\pi}\beta < \bar{\pi}\omega(a)$ a.e on C . We conclude that for almost all $a \in A$, there does not exist a measure $\alpha \in L^1(\bar{\omega})$ such that $\xi(a) \prec_a \alpha$ and $\bar{\pi}\alpha \leq \bar{\pi}\omega(a)$ a.e. Fact 3 now implies that there exists a bounded Borel set π^* that agree with $\bar{\pi}$ almost everywhere and supports ξ as an equilibrium price.

Finally, since the market is economically thick in the sense of Ostroy and Zame, all of the conditions for Theorem 3 of Ostroy–Zame ([34], p.604) but the convexity of preferences are satisfied, hence all equilibrium prices belong to a norm compact subset of $C(K)$ which implies $\pi^* \in C(K)$ (notice that the convexity is not required for this result). \square

4 Concluding Remarks

4.1 Mas-Colell's Model with Differentiated and Indivisible Commodities

The model of Mas-Colell [27] is described as follows. There exist differentiated commodities and only one homogeneous commodity in the market, hence the consumption set which is assumed to be identical for all consumers is defined by

$$X^M = H \times D, \quad H = \mathbb{R}_+, \quad D = \{\xi \in \mathcal{M}(K) \mid \xi(B) \leq \hat{\xi} \text{ for all } B \in \mathcal{B}(K)\}.$$

A typical element of X^M is denoted by (x, ξ) , $x \in H$ and $\xi \in D$. Notice that the differentiated commodities are assumed to be integer valued, or they are indivisible. The set $H = \mathbb{R}_+$ is unbounded, but D is assumed to be bounded above by $\hat{\xi} > 0$. $\hat{\xi}$ is intended to be a very large number. The set of all allowed preferences is denoted as \mathcal{P}^M . The assumptions on \mathcal{P}^M are

(d) the measure space $([0, 1], \mathcal{B}([0, 1]), \bar{\ell})$ (here $\bar{\ell}$ is the Lebesgue measure on the Borel σ -algebra) is a realization of ν .

As a corollary, we obtain that an atomless probability space $(A, \mathcal{A}, \lambda)$ realizes a non-symmetric equilibrium of an atomless distributional economy μ if and only if it is saturated. For the proof of Theorem 5, see Khan-Rath-Yu-Zhang [16]. They proved their result for the Nash equilibria of the large distributional game of Mas-Colell [28] type. For the corresponding result for the market equilibria, see Sagara-Suzuki [44].

References

- [1] Aliprantis, C. D. and K. C. Border, *Infinite Dimensional Analysis: A Hitchhiker's Guide*, 3rd edn., Springer, Berlin, 2006.
- [2] Aumann, R. J., (1964). "Markets with a continuum of traders", *Econometrica* **32**, 39–50.
- [3] Aumann, R. J., (1966). "Existence of competitive equilibria in markets with a continuum of traders", *Econometrica* **34**, 1–17.
- [4] Bewley, T.F., (1973) "The Equality of the Core and the Set of Equilibria in Economies with Infinitely Many Commodities and Continuum of Traders", *International Economic Review* **14**, 383-393.
- [5] Bewley, T.F., (1991) "A Very Weak Theorem on the Existence of Equilibria in Atomless Economies with Infinitely Many Commodities", in *Equilibrium Theory in Infinite Dimensional Spaces* Ali Khan, M., and N. Yannelis (Eds), Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York.
- [6] Carmona, G. and K. Podczeck, (2009) "On the Existence of Pure-Strategy Equilibria in Large Games," *Journal of Economic Theory* **144**, 1300-1319.
- [7] Diestel, J. and J.J. Uhl, (1977) *Vector Measures*, Mathematical Surveys and Monographs **15**, American Mathematical Society.
- [8] Hart, O. D., (1979) "Monopolistic Competition in a Large Economy with Differentiated Commodities", *Review of Economic Studies* **46**, 1-30.
- [9] Hart, S., W. Hildenbrand, and E. Kohlberg, (1974) "On Equilibrium Allocations as Distributions on the Commodity Space", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **1**, 159-166.
- [10] Hildenbrand, W., (1974) *Core and Equilibria of a Large Economy*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, New Jersey.

- [11] Hotelling, H. (1929) “Stability in Competition,” *The Economic Journal* **39**, 41-57.
- [12] Jones, L., (1983) “Existence of Equilibria with Infinitely Many Consumers and Infinitely Many Commodities”, *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **12**, 119-138.
- [13] Jones, L., (1984) “A Competitive Model of Commodity Differentiation,” *Econometrica* **52**, 507-530.
- [14] Jones, L., (1987) “The Efficiency of Monopolistically Competitive Equilibria in Large Economies: Commodity Differentiation with Gross Substitutes”, *Journal of Economic Theory* **41**, 356-391.
- [15] Keisler, H.J. and Y.N. Sun, (2009) “Why Saturated Probability Spaces are Necessary”, *Advances in Mathematics* **221** 1584-1607.
- [16] Khan, M.A., K.P. Rath, H. Yu, and Y. Zhang, (2013) “Strategic Representation and Realization of Large Distributional Games”, forthcoming in *Economic Theory*.
- [17] Khan, M.A. and N. Sagara, (2013) “Maharam-Types and Lyapunov’s Theorem for Vector Measures on Banach Spaces”, *Illinois Journal of Mathematics* **57**, 145-169.
- [18] Khan, M.A. and N. Sagara, (2014) “Weak Sequential Convergence in $L^1(\mu, X)$ and an Exact Version of Fatou’s Lemma”, *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications* **412**, 554-563.
- [19] Khan, M.A. and N. Sagara, (2015) “Maharam-Types and Lyapunov’s Theorem for Vector Measures on Locally Convex Spaces with Control Measures”, forthcoming in *Journal of Convex Analysis* **22**.
- [20] Khan, M.A., N. Sagara, and T. Suzuki, (2014) “An Exact Fatou’s Lemma for Gelfand Integrals: Equivalence of the Saturation and Fatou Properties”, Department of Economics, The Johns Hopkins University, *mimeo*.
- [21] Khan, M.A., N. Sagara, and T. Suzuki, (2015) “On a Theorem of Mas-Colell for a Model with Differentiated and Indivisible Commodities”, Department of Economics, Meiji-Gakuin University, *mimeo*.
- [22] Khan, M.A. and Y.N. Sun, (1991) “On Symmetric Cournot-Nash Equilibrium Distributions in a Finite-Action, Atomless Game”, in *Equilibrium Theory in Infinite Dimensional Spaces* Ali Khan, M., and N. Yan-nelis (Eds), Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York.

- [23] Khan, M.A. and N.C. Yannelis, (1991) "Equilibria in Markets with a Continuum of Agents and Commodities", in *Equilibrium Theory in Infinite Dimensional Spaces* Ali Khan, M., and N. Yannelis (Eds), Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York.
- [24] Lancaster, K. (1975) "Socially Optimal Product Differentiation", *The American Economic Review* **65**, 567-585.
- [25] Loeb, P.A., (1975) "Conversion from Nonstandard to Standard Measure Spaces and Applications in Probability Theory", *Transactions of American Mathematical Society* **211**, 113-122.
- [26] Martin-da-Rocha, V.F., (2004) "Equilibrium in Large Economies with Differentiated Commodities and Non-ordered Preferences", *Economic Theory* **23**, 529-552.
- [27] Mas-Colell, A., (1975) "A Model of Equilibrium with Differentiated Commodities", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **2**, 263-296.
- [28] Mas-Colell, A., (1984) "On a Theorem of Schmeidler", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **13**, 201-206.
- [29] Mas-Colell, A., (1986) "The Price Equilibrium Existence Problem in Topological Vector Lattices", *Econometrica* **54**, 1039-1054.
- [30] Noguchi, M., (1997a) "Economies with a Continuum of Consumers, a Continuum of Suppliers, and an Infinite Dimensional Commodity Space", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **27**, 1-21.
- [31] Noguchi, M., (1997b) "Economies with a Continuum of Agents with the Commodity -Price Pairing (ℓ^∞, ℓ^1) ", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **8**, 265-287.
- [32] Noguchi, M., (2009) "Existence of Nash Equilibria in Large Games", *Journal of Mathematical Economics* **45**, 168-184.
- [33] Noguchi, M. and W. Zame, (2006) "Competitive Markets with Externalities", *Theoretical Economics* **1**, 143-166.
- [34] Ostroy, J.M. and W. Zame, (1994) "Nonatomic Economies and the Boundaries of Perfect Competition", *Econometrica* **62**, 593-633.
- [35] Pascoa, M. R., (1997) "Noncooperative Equilibrium and Chamberlinian Monopolistic Competition", *Journal of Economic Theory* **60**, 335-353.
- [36] Podczeck, K., (1997) "Markets with Infinitely Many Commodities and a Continuum of Agents with Non-Convex Preferences", *Economic Theory* **9**, 385-426.

- [50] Suzuki, T., (2014) “A Coalitional Production Economy with Infinitely Many Indivisible Commodities”, forthcoming in *Economic Theory Bulletin*.
- [51] Tourky, R. and N.C. Yannelis, (2001) “Markets with More Agents than Commodities: Aumann’s ”Hidden” Assumption”, *Journal of Economic Theory* **101**, 189-221.
- [52] Yannelis, N.C., (1991) “Integration of Banach-Valued Correspondences”, in *Equilibrium Theory in Infinite Dimensional Spaces* Ali Khan, M., and N. Yannelis (Eds), Springer-Verlag, Berlin and New York.